ACES, TOXIC STRESS AND THE LIFE COURSE MODEL

ERIKA LICHTER, SC.D, MS, MA
CHRISTOPHER PEZZULLO, DO
HILLARY COLCORD, MHRT/C
Aggregated to 10,000 Population-years

LE = 85.1
Carrabassett Valley
Coplin
Eustis
Wyman

LE = 83.8
Wayne

LE = 86.6
Limington

LE by Area, 2001-2010

Difference from state (yrs.)

-6.9 to -5.0
4.9 to -3.0
-2.9 to -2.1
-2.0 to +2.0
2.1 to 3.0
3.1 to 5.0
5.1 to 8.1
Aggregated to 10,000 Population-years

LE = 72.3
Greenbush

LE = 73.0
Alton
Argyle

LE = 73.2
Kenduskeag

LE = 71.6
Macwahoc
Mattawamkeag
Kingman
Drew
Reed

LE = 72.3
Grand Lake Stream
Talmadge
Topsfield
Vanceboro
Waite
Passamaquoddy Indian Twp

LE by Area, 2001-2010
Difference from state (yrs.)
-6.9 to -5.0
-4.9 to -3.0
-2.9 to -2.1
-2.0 to +2.0
2.1 to 3.0
3.1 to 5.0
5.1 to 8.1
KEY QUESTIONS

• Why are some groups more likely to suffer from cardiovascular disease, HIV, or cancer?
• Why are some patients more or less likely to adhere to treatment regimens?
• Why does life expectancy vary based on where you live?
• Why do health disparities exist and persist across population groups?
• What are the factors that influence the capacity of individuals or populations to reach their full potential for health and well-being?
1. Explain how early life experiences influence long-term health and development
2. Discuss the key concepts of ACES, toxic stress and life course theory
3. Discuss “social determinants of health” and provide examples of determinants impacting the health of individuals
4. Construct ways to apply understanding of ACES and life course theory to practice
EPIDEMIOLOGY AND SOCIAL EPIDEMIOLOGY

• Epidemiology: The study of the distribution and causes of diseases

• Social Epidemiology: Study of societal factors that determine patterning of disease within and across populations
  • How society “gets into the body.”
  • Is there any epidemiology that is not social?
    • Social variation in what is being studied
Social Epidemiology Definition

• Social epidemiology focuses on the social factors contributing to incidence or prevalence of disease (as opposed to the physical or biological).

• Branch of epidemiology that studies the social distribution and social determinants of states of health

Berkman and Kawachi, 2000
LIFE COURSE THEORY

• Health develops along a continuum, not disconnected unrelated stages.

• Health outcomes result from the interplay of social, economic, and environmental factors mixed with biological, behavioral and psychosocial issues.

• Interplay occurs across a person’s life and have cumulative affect.
KEY CONCEPTS OF LIFE COURSE THEORY (T2E2)

- **Timeline** – health is cumulative and longitudinal
- **Timing** – health and health trajectories are particularly affected during critical/sensitive periods.
- **Environment** – the broader environment affects health and development.
- **Equity** – health inequality reflects more than genetics and personal choice.

– Fine and Kotelchuck
LIFE COURSE THEME #1: TIMELINE

• Health develops over a lifetime

• Health improves or diminishes based in part on exposures to risk and protective factors.

• There are cumulative and longitudinal impacts on an individual’s life span and across generations.
• Special attention is placed on the relationship between the health of parents and the health of their children
CUMULATIVE EFFECTS

Chronic stress results in wear and tear on the body’s adaptive systems, leading to declining health and function over time.
RISK AND PROTECTIVE FACTORS

Ready to Learn

6 mo  12 mo  18 mo  24 mo  24 mo  3 yrs  5 yrs
RISK AND PROTECTIVE FACTORS

Ready to Learn

- Poverty
- Lack of health services
- Family Discord
- Unsafe housing

Risk Factors

6 mo 12 mo 18 mo 24 mo 24 mo 3 yrs 5 yrs
RISK AND PROTECTIVE FACTORS AND HEALTH DISPARITIES

ADVERSE CHILDHOOD EXPERIENCES (ACE)

• Study by Robert Anda and Vincent Felitti

• https://www.ajpmonline.org/article/S0749-3797(98)00017-8/abstract

• https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/childabuseandneglect/acestudy/aboutace.html
ACE STUDY RESULTS

• More than half (almost 2/3) had at least one ACE

• 1 in 8 had four or more ACEs

• Average pediatrician will see 2-4 children with an ACE score of 4 or more each day
ACES AND HEALTH FINDINGS

- Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease
- Depression
- Fetal death
- Health-related quality of life
- SUD
- Ischemic heart disease
- Liver disease
- Poor work performance
- Financial stress
- Poor academic achievement

- Risk for interpersonal/intimate partner and sexual violence
- Multiple sexual partners
- Sexually transmitted diseases
- Smoking
- Suicide attempts
- Unintended pregnancies
- Early initiation of smoking and sexual activity
- Adolescent pregnancy

https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/acesstudy/about.html
RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN ACES AND HEALTH

Mechanism by which Adverse Childhood Experiences Influence Health and Well-being Throughout the Lifespan
SIXTY PERCENT OF MAINE ADULTS HAVE EXPERIENCED AT LEAST ONE ACE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACES</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0 ACES</td>
<td>40.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 ACE</td>
<td>21.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-3 ACES</td>
<td>22.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4+ ACES</td>
<td>14.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

BRFSS, 2010
THOSE WITH LOWER INCOMES ARE MORE LIKELY TO HAVE 4+ ACES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income Range</th>
<th>Percent with 4+ ACEs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$50,000 or more</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$35,000 to less than $50,000</td>
<td>15.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$25,000 to less than $35,000</td>
<td>12.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$15,000 to less than $25,000</td>
<td>20.0*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than $15,000</td>
<td>28.9*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Statistically significantly higher than income groups over $25,000.
ADULTS WITH 4+ ACES ARE LESS LIKELY TO HAVE A HIGH SCHOOL EDUCATION

- Graduated from College or Technical School: 10.1**
- Attended College or Technical School: 15.5
- Graduated High School: 16.6
- Did not graduate High School: 30.3*

*Statistically significantly higher than all other education groups.
**Statistically significantly lower than all other education groups.
THOSE WITH 4+ ACES ARE MORE LIKELY TO HAVE POOR HEALTH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Condition</th>
<th>0 ACEs</th>
<th>4+ ACEs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Current Smoker</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obese</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depression</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activity limitation</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1 IN 4 MAINE CHILDREN HAVE 2 OR MORE ACES

- 48% No ACEs
- 27% 1 ACE
- 25% 2+ ACEs

NSCH, 2016
TOXIC STRESS

• Long lasting, frequent, or strong intensity
• More extreme precipitants of childhood stress (ACEs)
• Insufficient social-emotional buffering (Deficient levels of emotion coaching, re-processing, reassurance and support)
• Potentially permanent changes and long-term effects
TOXIC STRESS AND THE BRAIN

- Constant presence of adrenaline and cortisol
- Toxic stress changes architecture of the brain
- Damages the prefrontal cortex
- Epigenetics
Toxic Stress Changes Brain Architecture

Normal

Typical neuron with many connections

Toxic Stress

Neuron damaged by toxic stress -- fewer connections

Prefrontal Cortex and Hippocampus
How could stress affect health?

1. **Stressor**
2. Hypothalamus
   - CRH
3. Pituitary Gland
   - ACTH
4. Adrenal Glands
   - CORTISOL

**Damage to multiple organs & systems**
- Inflammation, immune suppression, chronic disease, premature aging

Braveman, P.
IMPACT OF CHILDHOOD STRESS

- Childhood Stress
  - Hyper-responsive stress response; reduced coping
  - Chronic fight or flight
  - Changes to Brain Architecture
Epigenetics: Which genes are turned on/off, when, and where

• Ecology (environment/experience) influences how the genetic blueprint is read and utilized
• Ecological effects at the molecular level
• Stress-induced changes in gene expression
• “Genes may load the gun, but the environment pulls the trigger”
• Through epigenetic mechanisms, the early childhood ecology becomes biologically embedded, influencing how the genome functions
WHAT WOULD IT LOOK LIKE TO ADDRESS HEALTH CONSIDERING A PERSON’S “TIMELINE”?

• Greater focus on health promotion from the youngest ages forward.
• Focus on developing services and systems that provide routine, early identification of health risks and early intervention to address and minimize the impact of risks.
WHAT WOULD IT LOOK LIKE TO ADDRESS HEALTH CONSIDERING A PERSON’S “TIMELINE”?

• Improve caregiver/community capacity to prevent or minimize risk factors (e.g., promote the safe, stable and nurturing relationships that turn off the physiologic stress response)

• Improve caregiver/community capacity to promote healthy, adaptive coping skills
LIFE COURSE THEME #2: TIMING

- **Critical Period**: Time when certain things must occur for normal development to occur
- **Sensitive Period**: Time when a particular develop occurs most easily
BARKER HYPOTHESIS/FETAL ORIGINS HYPOTHESIS

• Introduced in 1990 by David Barker
• Intrauterine growth retardation, low birth weight, and premature birth related to later hypertension, coronary heart disease, and non-insulin-dependent diabetes
• Fetal programming can permanently shape the body’s structure, function, and metabolism and contribute to adult disease.
BIRTHWEIGHT AND CORONARY HEART DISEASE (BARKER HYPOTHESIS)

Age Adjusted Relative Risk

Birthweight (lbs.)

<5.0: 1.5
5.0-5.5: 1.25
5.6-7.0: 1.15
7.1-8.5: 1.0
8.6-10.0: 0.9
>10.0: 0.7

Human Brain Development
Neural Connections for Different Functions Develop Sequentially

Sensory Pathways (Vision, Hearing)
Language
Higher Cognitive Function

FIRST YEAR
Birth (Months) (Years)

WHAT WOULD IT LOOK LIKE IF YOU ADDRESSED HEALTH BY TAKING “TIMING” INTO CONSIDERATION?

• Assure the availability of services and supports during critical or sensitive periods throughout the lifespan.

• Focus on interventions that help assure a healthy pregnancy for mother and baby and services and supports that help assure the healthy development of children – and their families – during the period of early childhood.
LIFE COURSE THEME #3: ENVIRONMENT

• Physical, social, and economic environments shape health and disease patterns across populations and communities.

• Environment includes not only physical factors, but also social and economic factors, and the capacity of the community to engage in change.
Ecological Model

The interplay of biological, social, and environmental factors

- Genetics, behaviors, choices, knowledge
- Parents, siblings, extended family, peers
- Neighborhoods, schools, parks, workplaces
- Health, education, and legal systems, media, business
- Economic systems, cultural values and ideals

INDIVIDUAL

RELATIONSHIPS

COMMUNITY

INSTITUTIONAL

SOCIETAL
Where you live affects your health

**Place**

**Risky Places**
- High rates of crime
- Presence of environmental toxins
- Segregation and isolation
- Lack of jobs, housing, transportation, healthy food, health care, social services

**Protective Places**
- Food stores with fruits and vegetables
- Healthy and safe places to walk and play
- Access to health care and social services
- Safe schools that prepare children for future employment

**Good Health**

**Poor Health**
Your ZIP Code shouldn’t predict how long you’ll live, but it does.
“Morbidity and mortality are not random, but geographically and socially patterned to render some people winners and others losers.”

Poverty
Policies
Institutions
Laws
Access to education
Employment opportunities
Social marginalization

Access to tobacco cessation programs
Ease of access to tobacco and alcohol
Lack of money to purchase healthy foods
Live where healthy food not easily available
Access to health screenings, health insurance, health care

Tobacco and alcohol use
Poor nutrition
Physical inactivity

Elevated cholesterol
High blood pressure
Diabetes

Heart disease
HOW CAN WEALTH AFFECT OUR HEALTH?

WEALTH CAN BUY:

- Medical care
- Housing and neighborhood conditions
- Nutrition and physical activity options
- Services
- Less stress
- Family stability

PARENTS’ WEALTH SHAPES CHILDREN’S:

- Education
- Occupation
- Wealth
HOW WOULD YOU ADDRESS HEALTH CONSIDERING A PERSON’S ENVIRONMENT?

• Link people to service systems that can address environmental factors (e.g., employment services, housing, family support programs, etc.)

• Promote integrated, multi-sector service systems and assure that those systems are easily accessed.

• Develop population and place-based community strategies aimed at changing environments, and addressing root cause determinants of health.

• Requires alliances that may go beyond the usual reach of public health (e.g., with land use planners, parks and recreation, housing developers and public housing authorities, etc.), and it requires partnering with community residents in ways that enable communities to effect change.
LIFE COURSE THEME #4: EQUITY

• Differences in health across populations and communities cannot be explained solely in terms of genetic make-up or individual choices, but rather reflect the impact of broader societal and environmental conditions over time.
DETERMINANTS OF HEALTH

- Environment
- Interpersonal
- Behavior
- Psychosocial

Health Outcome
SOCIAL DETERMINANTS OF HEALTH

• Focusing on an individual’s lifestyle ignores social influences on health.
• Health behaviors are a consequence of the social conditions and environment in which people live.
• Behavioral choices are situated within historical, political, economic and community context.
HEALTH EQUITY

• **Health Equity** is the “attainment of the highest level of health for all people.”

• **Health Inequities** are differences in health that are avoidable, unfair, and unjust.

• **Health Disparities** are differences in health outcomes among groups of people linked with social, economic and/or environmental disadvantage. Health disparities are avoidable and unequitable.

U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. [http://www.healthypeople.gov/sites/default/files/Phase1_0.pdf](http://www.healthypeople.gov/sites/default/files/Phase1_0.pdf)

Health Equity Institute, San Francisco University. [http://healthequity.sfsu.edu/content/defining-health-equity](http://healthequity.sfsu.edu/content/defining-health-equity)

HEALTH INEQUITIES CAN BE CAUSED BY:

- **Social conditions**: When a person or group is treated differently because of their race, sex, class, sexual orientation, or immigration status.

- **Economic conditions**: Unequal opportunities can lead to less access to educational and employment opportunities.

- **Environmental conditions**: Where you live can affect your health due to neighborhood conditions, economic opportunities, school quality, access to healthy food, opportunities for physical activity, exposure to violence, cleanliness of the environment, and social support.
CLIFF ANALOGY

Source: Camara Jones,
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2zAol4eKdFo
HOW DO YOU ADDRESS EQUITY?

• Go beyond tracking disparities, to identify and address root causes of disparities at the population level.
• Use an “equity lens” to continually assess the potential for differential impact of public health interventions, even those that are evidence-based.
• Interventions that focus on individual behavior changes need to take into account the broader social and environmental context in which people live.
SUMMARY: LIFE COURSE THEORY

• Considers health an integrated continuum across the life course

• Health outcomes across the life span result from a complex interplay of biological, behavioral, social, and environmental factors

• Critical developmental periods such as pregnancy, childhood, and adolescence differentially impact health trajectories

• Opportunities to address institutional racism and abate risk factors with protective factors

Griffith, 2010
What can we do?
Improving health requires collaboration across sectors

**Economic**
- Employment opportunities
- Fair Wages
- Family and medical leave
- Paid sick days

**Education**
- High performing schools
- Access to higher education
- Public preschool
- Continuing education and vocational school

**Health**
- Healthy Pregnancies
- Access to quality medical and mental health care
- Clear health communication
- Disease management

**Community**
- Parenting support
- Social services
- Social support
- Tolerance and respect
- Cultural competence

**Physical Environment**
- Safe neighborhoods and schools
- Sidewalks, parks and playgrounds
- Healthy food options
- Public transportation
“Throughout life and at all stages, even for those whose trajectories seem limited, risk factors can be reduced and protective factors enhanced, to improve current and subsequent health and well-being”

-Fine and Kotelchuck
Health center patient populations are more complex because they have higher rates of chronic conditions and social risk factors associated with poorer health outcomes.

Percent of U.S. population vs. health center patient population for selected demographics, 2017

- Hypertension Prevalence: 45% in Health Center Patient Population vs. 32% in U.S. Population
- Diabetes Prevalence: 21% in Health Center Patient Population vs. 11% in U.S. Population
- Income at or Below Federal Poverty Level: 69% in Health Center Patient Population vs. 13% in U.S. Population
- Homelessness: 5% in Health Center Patient Population vs. 0.2% in U.S. Population

Source: National Association of Community Health Centers, May 2019

HOW DOES EDUCATION IMPACT HEALTH?

Educational attainment

Health knowledge
Literacy
Problem solving skills
Coping skills

Health-related behaviors

Braveman, P.
HOW DOES EDUCATION IMPACT HEALTH?

Educational attainment

Work
- Work-related resources
  - Health insurance
    - Sick leave
    - Wellness programs
    - Stress
  - Neighborhood
    - Diet and exercise options
    - Stress
- Working Conditions
  - Physical hazards
    - Demands
    - Stress
- Income

Health

Braveman, P.
HOW DOES EDUCATION IMPACT HEALTH?

- Educational attainment
- Social Networks
  - Social standing
  - Control beliefs (powerlessness, fatalism)
- Social and economic resources
  - Perceived status
  - Stress
- Social support
- Stress
- Coping
- Response to stressors

Braveman, P.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Stability</th>
<th>Neighborhood and Physical Environment</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Food</th>
<th>Community and Social Context</th>
<th>Health Care System</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employment</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>Literacy</td>
<td>Hunger</td>
<td>Social integration</td>
<td>Health coverage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Access to healthy options</td>
<td>Support systems</td>
<td>Provider availability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenses</td>
<td>Safety</td>
<td>Early childhood education</td>
<td>Hunger</td>
<td>Community engagement</td>
<td>Provider availability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debt</td>
<td>Parks</td>
<td>Vocational training</td>
<td>Access to healthy options</td>
<td>Discrimination</td>
<td>Provider linguistic and cultural competency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical bills</td>
<td>Playgrounds</td>
<td>Higher education</td>
<td>Healthy options</td>
<td>Stress</td>
<td>Quality of care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support</td>
<td>Walkability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Zip code / geography</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Health Outcomes**
Mortality, Morbidity, Life Expectancy, Health Care Expenditures, Health Status, Functional Limitations
MAINE PUBLIC HEALTH DATA

• Maine Shared Community Health Needs Assessment reports - https://www.maine.gov/dhhs/mecdc/phdata/MaineCHNA/

• Maine CDC Data Reports
FINDING SOCIAL DETERMINANTS DATA

Interactive atlas of heart disease and stroke

Healthy People 2020

Social Vulnerability Index
https://svi.cdc.gov/factsheet.html

Institute of Health Metrics and Evaluation, University of Washington
https://vizhub.healthdata.org/subnational/usa
CLINICAL INTERVENTIONS
WHAT CAN WE DO SYSTEMICALLY?
ADDRESSING ACES AND TOXIC STRESS

• Addressing Readiness to Change
ADDRESSING ACES AND TOXIC STRESS

• Educating staff and patients on the importance of addressing trauma and ACEs
ADDRESSING ACES AND TOXIC STRESS

• Deciding who to assess and when
ADDRESSING ACES AND TOXIC STRESS

• Deciding how to screen
  https://www.ncjfcj.org/sites/default/files/Finding%20Your%20ACE%20Score.pdf

• LEC5
  https://www.ptsd.va.gov/professional/assessment/documents/LEC5_Standard_Self-report.PDF

• PTSD-PC

ADDRESSING ACES AND TOXIC STRESS

• Identifying community resources and appropriate interventions for patients and families

• https://www.traumainformedcare.chcs.org/what-is-trauma-informed-care/